

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

In re Ethicon, Inc. Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation	Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327 JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE
THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO ETHICON WAVE 3 CASES: <i>Identified on Exhibit A</i>	

MOTION TO EXCLUDE EXPERT TESTIMONY OF MICHAEL KARRAM, MD

Plaintiffs in the above-captioned consolidated case respectfully move this Court to exclude the testimony of Michael Karram, M.D., a proffered expert witness for the Defendants, regarding the safety and efficacy of Ethicon's TVT and TVT-O mesh products. Dr. Karram does not possess the necessary qualifications to render many of his opinions, which is the first requirement for an expert witness to satisfy under the Rules. Additionally, Dr. Karram has not followed a reliable methodology to reach many of his opinions.

Specifically, Dr. Karram offers opinions regarding the *adequacy* of Ethicon's warnings in its TVT and TVT-O IFUs and patient brochures, but he lacks the necessary qualifications to testify regarding the adequacy of Ethicon's warnings. Despite the Court consistently excluding state-of-mind testimony, Dr. Karram also seeks to testify as to the state-of-mind of doctors, including what he erroneously believes *all* doctors know about the risks of these products. Finally, Dr. Karram seeks to testify as to the biomechanical aspects of the mesh used in these devices, yet he has not followed any reliable methodology and admits he is not qualified in these areas. Accordingly, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court exclude Dr. Karram's opinions and testimony for the reasons discussed here and in the accompanying Memorandum.

Respectfully submitted this September 19, 2016

/s/ Joseph J. Zonies

Joseph J. Zonies, Esq.

Zonies Law LLC

1900 Wazee Street, Suite 203

Denver, Colorado 80202

(720) 464-5300

(720) 961-9252 (fax)

jzonies@zonieslaw.com

/s/ Thomas P. Cartmell

Thomas P. Cartmell, Esq.

Jeffrey M. Kuntz, Esq.

Wagstaff & Cartmell LLP

4740 Grand Avenue, Suite 300

Kansas City, MO 64112

816-701-1102

816-531-2372 (fax)

tcartmell@wcllp.com

jkuntz@wcllp.com

/s/ D. Renee Baggett

Bryan F. Aylstock, Esq.

Renee Baggett, Esq.

Aylstock, Witkin, Kreis and Overholtz, PLC

17 East Main Street, Suite 200

Pensacola, Florida 32563

(850) 202-1010

(850) 916-7449 (fax)

rbaggett@awkolaw.com

baylstock@awkolaw.com

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 19, 2016, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the list of participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Jenelle Cox